

the Jehovah's Witness tradition in Russia effectively illustrates the need to protect smaller-scale sites.

Peter Petkoff's essay, "Developing and Implementing Innovative Preventative Mechanisms for the Protection of Religious Heritage Sites Through Soft Law Approaches," expands on two earlier works covering the legal protection of sacred sites. Naming, to Petkoff, is a powerful and normative act in distinguishing boundaries between sacred and profane. The legal issues that surround preserving sacred sites are numerous and complex, and traditional approaches neglect the complexities inherent in this act of naming. The essay therefore "seeks to develop and implement innovative preventative mechanisms for the protection of religious heritage sites" (146). What follows are holistic approaches to international law and a series of prevention-based practices, all of which are defined as "legal tools" that can work to achieve this end.

Mario Ricca's essay "Ubiquitous Sacred Places: The Planetary Interplay of their Meaning and Legal Protection" concludes the section by recognizing the need to craft a common language for the discussion of sacred sites. Ricca avoids a single definition of the term "sacred" in this essay, as each religious tradition understands "sacred" differently. The task becomes one of translation that will allow adherents of a single tradition to understand how other traditions name their own places "sacred."

Alberto Melloni's postface, "A Chronology of the UNESCO Dispute on Jerusalem and Its Holy Places," aims to review how UNESCO sought to handle the process of naming sacred sites from 1980 until present day. Recent trends reveal an attempt to influence the naming of holy places within UNESCO, typically preferring a single name of significance to a single religious tradition while neglecting parallel names of significance to other religious traditions. Melloni meticulously reviews the history of naming sacred sites by tracing sacred nomenclature through UNESCO statements and reports released over the years. Following the postface, a Name Index contains personal names of authors cited as well as many of the personal names discussed in the volume itself. Toponyms, however, are not included in the index.

As a whole, this thought-provoking volume will certainly prove beneficial to onomasticians studying sacred toponyms and their cultural impact. Of the essays reviewed above, a few are more relevant to the study of names than others, but they all demonstrate the import of onomastics to the study of holy places. Aside from its focus on the academic study of names, the volume achieves its primary goal; it presents a measured scholarly response to a divisive issue of public interest, and the essays collectively reveal historical and religious precedents for the preservation of sacred sites and the many sacred names ascribed to them.

Boston University

 <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-9424-6911>

BRANDON SIMONSON 



Of the Same Breath: Indigenous Animal and Place Names. By LUCIE A. MÖLLER. Bloemfontein, South Africa: Sun Press, 2017. Pp. xiii + 365. (pbk R475) ISBN 978-1-928424-02-4; (e-book R380) ISBN 978-1-928424-03-1. Available from www.sun-e-shop.co.za; electronic version is available on the African Sun Media App downloadable from Google Play Store/Apple iStore.

The onomastic team at the University of the Free State in Bloemfontein, South Africa, has made important contributions over the years to the study of names, primarily the place names of southern Africa. Lucie A. Möller, Peter E. Raper, L. Theodorus du Plessis, and Adrian Koopman, individually and together, have published books and articles on a variety of toponymic subjects, including the fourth edition of *Dictionary of Southern African Place Names* (2014), reviewed in this journal in December 2019. The names of southern

Africa require special expertise because of the multitude of languages, both living and extinct, which must be accounted for in determining the origins of the names. In the present book, the author faced additional concerns, explaining not just the way that place names came from the names of animals but how the animal names came from the sounds the animals make or in some cases their appearance, their habits, or their habitats.

To grasp the complex thesis of this book, I brought up a memory from my early childhood. When I was five or six years old, I was sitting in our back yard with my younger sister when a neighbor's dog barked, making a sound which to my ears and to hers was clearly "woof." She turned to me and said, "Is that a wolf?" More recently, this memory made me think about some of the common creatures in America that are called by names based on the sounds they make. Wolves don't "woof" (they howl), but the common American names for some animals, especially birds, are onomatopoeic. Think of the whip-poor-will, the bobolink, the bobwhite, and the killdeer. In other animals the sound may come from a source other than a voice. A rattlesnake is identified by the sound made by vibrating scales on its tail, and a katydid by rubbing its wings together (stridulating). In turn, these animal names, echoic in origin, occasionally show up as place names. A check of the Geographic Names Information System (GNIS) of the names of natural features in the U.S. shows 2 for bobwhite and katydid, 3 for bobolink, 15 for killdeer, 46 for whip-poor-will, and 1,107 for rattlesnake.

These place names likely came from an association of these creatures with the place. The name of the creature must have come from someone who heard the sound and imagined how it might be pronounced in human terms, although in most cases someone else might have heard it differently. Some years ago Noel Perrin (1962) had an amusing short article in *The New Yorker* with the title "Old MacBerlitz Had a Farm," showing how the sounds of animals are interpreted differently by speakers of various languages or even of different environments in the same language. Visiting a friend in Malaysia, Perrin heard a dog bark and said something about the sound he heard, "bow-wow." His friend was confused, for what he heard was "wang-wang." Researching further, Perrin discovered that what to his ears in the early morning on the farm was "cock-a-doodle-do" was to the German farmer "kikeriki," and to the Dutch "ku-kela-ku." He offers many more examples (28–29).

All this is to introduce the subject of Lucie Möller's book, which is many times more complex and sophisticated than my American examples. She examines 725 place names of southern Africa, a region comprising all or parts of 11 countries: Angola, Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Mozambique, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland, Tanzania, Zambia, and Zimbabwe. She examines place names that come from dozens of languages, language families, and dialects, including Auen, Bantu, Bushman (or San), Herero, Hie, Khoikhoi, Kung, Nama, Ndebele, Sesarwa, Sotho, Swazi, Tswana, Venda, Xhosa, and Zulu, to name just a few of the many known languages in southern Africa, both living and extinct. She also includes many names that are in English and Afrikaans, two of the eleven official languages of South Africa alone. And there are also occasional names in German. Dr. Möller is eminently qualified for this study, having been actively involved in name study in Africa for more than forty years. But the theme of this book grew into a project "so divergent and challenging, that it became an all-encompassing enriching experience" (3).

The main title of the book may be a bit misleading, since Möller emphasizes the effect of each animal's appearance and habits on naming almost as much as on its vocalizations, its "breath." In her introduction she says, "Some of the hunter-gatherer Bushman (San) place names demonstrate the use of various basic naming devices, such as onomatopoeia ... as well as imagery and description referring to physical characteristics or habits of these creatures." These acts, she goes on to say, may be the main source of the naming process and may even have influenced "the evolutionary processes of language development and the act of naming" (1).

Two language families dominate the examples, Bushman and Khoikhoi.¹ Scholars disagree over whether these two families are related or whether they are completely separate in origin. So much language contact has taken place in the thousands of years that speakers of these languages have lived in shared territories that it is often impossible to distinguish cognates from borrowings. Bantu languages, including Zulu, are also considered, but are of less significance to the theme.

Interest in the indigenous languages of southern Africa and recording (in writing) words and sounds began in the 17th century, flourished in the 19th and 20th, and continues to the present. Explorers, missionaries, and settlers often recorded the names of animals in many languages, and many of these records still exist. Möller had access to these sources and is generous in citing this early material, especially the work of Dorothea Bleek, who in 1929 published *Comparative Vocabularies of Bushman Languages* and in 1956 *A Bushman Dictionary*.

In the course of her book Möller examines some 54 mammals, 15 birds, 5 reptiles, and 10 invertebrates, in some cases individual species, in others grouping similar species such as babblers or chats, orioles and shrikes, frogs, bullfrogs and toads, or scorpions and spiders. The mammals, by far, get the most attention, 170 pages; birds, reptiles, and invertebrates occupy only 31, 28, and 8, respectively. In this review, space allows only a limited number of examples.

The section on mammals begins with the carnivores and, reflecting the medieval hierarchy of beasts, with the lion (*Panthera leo*—genus and species labels are given for each creature). In several Bushman languages the names are *zam*, *hu:m* and *ho:um*; these words supposedly echo the lion's roar. In Khoikhoi dialects the transcription is *gamma*, *tgamma*, *chamma*, etc. Möller asserts that this range of names gives "a very accurate emulation of its loud roar" (72). A river bears the name *Chammago*, which early Afrikaans settlers translated to *Leeuwenrivier* or *Leeurivier* ("Lion River" in English). The Leeubos River seems also to be a translation of Chammago; in English it is "Lion Bush." Möller cites many other natural features that can be traced to the words for lion. From the lion she goes on to the other cats (family *Felidae*), ranging from large to small: cheetahs, leopards, caracals, African wild cats, serval cats, and the small spotted cat.

The common names in English or Afrikaans and in most of the indigenous languages do not follow the Linnaean classification system. For example, the cheetah (*Acinonyx jubatus*) is called "the hunting leopard" (*jagluiperd* in Afrikaans), and there is often no clear distinction between this cat and the true leopard (*Panthera pardus*). It is not clear just what sound these two animals make, but Möller says many of the Bushman languages have names for one or both of them that are "obvious onomatopoeic renderings." It's not clear just what sound is represented by these examples: *!kauë* from *!Xam*, *!hâû*, *!khum* from Auen, and several others.² For a toponym derived from these names she offers *Okongwe*, a settlement in Namibia, which is translated as "place of the leopard" (85–86).

Next come those animals from the family *Hyenidae*, which includes the aardwolf, which is not a true hyena, and well as two species of hyenas, spotted and brown. Although in English these animals were often called *wolves* (*wolwe* in Afrikaans), they are not true wolves. The hyena's "laugh" is probably one of the best known of African animal sounds, yet Möller does not clearly connect that to any of the place names.

Möller presents the *Canidae* family, including wild dogs, jackals, and foxes, plus other carnivores such as meerkats, mongoose (is that the plural?), honey badgers, bats, and mice. From there she moves on to primates (baboons and monkeys), non-ruminant hoofed mammals (rhinoceroses, hippopotamuses, elephants, antbears, anteaters, bush-pigs, warthogs, and porcupines), other hoofed animals (cattle, buffalo, giraffe, elands, kudus, gemsbok, sable antelopes, lechwes, waterbucks, bushbuck, reedbuck, springbuck, impalas, steenboks, oribis, klipspringers, duikers), *Equidae* (zebras, wild asses, wild

horses), and the “Alcelaphini Tribe” (wildebeests, blesboks, and hartebeests). Of these, space allows attention to only a few.

The African elephant (*Loxodonta africana*), *olifant* in Afrikaans, has had many names derived from separate observations: its great size, its penchant for trampling on any threat, and its penetrating trumpet call. Toponyms in several modern languages are widespread. In German, *Elephantenberg* ‘elephant mountain’ and *Elephantenfluss* ‘elephant river’ are names in Namibia. In South Africa there are at least five rivers with the name *Olifantsrivier*. But names from indigenous languages also abound. In KwaZulu-Natal, an eastern province of South Africa, are toponyms like *Gingindlovu*, *UMgungundlovu*, and *Endlovana*, the final element clearly derived from one or more Bantu languages whose names for the elephant include *indlovu*, *Ndhlovu*, *ndlopfu*, *tlou*, *ndou*, and *nzou*. In Zulu, *indlovu* means “to trample,” which may derive from the elephant’s name rather than the other way around. All these Bantu names have the vowel sound *ou*, which may echo the elephant’s trumpet-like call. Of this, however, Möller is cautious, saying only that this connection “appears viable” on the phonological level (157).

Of all the animals in Africa that might be considered wild beasts (*wildebeest* in Afrikaans), the name has been co-opted by certain members of the “Alcelaphini Tribe.” There are several species or sub-species of this ox-like antelope, the black wildebeest (*Connochaetes gnou*) and the blue wildebeest (*Connochaetes taurinus gnu*) being the most common. These creatures make a variety of sounds, and, as heard in different areas, different names have evolved. In Bushman and Khoikhoi areas, observers noticed that when the males are “strutting and moving the herd along, grunting or snorting in unison,” they make a sound like “genu-genu.” This gives us the familiar alternative name for the wildebeest: *gnu*. Speakers of other languages heard different sounds, “khokong,” “kokoñu,” “nkonkoni,” “nkhoni,” “ngongoni,” or “hongonyi.” Möller gives a few examples of toponyms. The Inqu or Inxu River in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa takes its name from the Xhosa word for the wildebeest, *iNqu*, an adaptation of the Bushman word *gnu*. A village in Namibia, Okovimburu, “is said to derive” from a word meaning “place of gnu, or wildebeest.” Möller continues, “The component *buru* in this adapted Herero toponym, may relate to the sound sequence: ‘gnu, gnu,’ emitted [sic] as [a] warning call by black and blue wildebeest to their herd.” *Cocong*, clearly from *khokong* or a variant, is the name of a small stream in the Free State/Lesotho region. In Botswana a hill named *Dikgokong* also comes from a variant of the same name, the element *di-* indicates location, hence “place of the wildebeest” (230–33).

Among the names of animals that may derive from other than their voices is that of the famously silent giraffe, known in Afrikaans as the *kameelperd* (*Giraffa Camelopardalis*). Other than a low-frequency hum, it has no voice to lend to toponyms, but one place name “may contain an undertone of sound association”: *Madubaduba*, the name of a farm in Mpumalanga Province east of Johannesburg, may be an echo of “the sound of galloping giraffe.” In Venda and Ndebele three names for giraffe, *thuba*, *thuda*, and *btundla* are phonologically close to *duba*, and the reduplication in *Madubaduba* reinforces the sound of galloping hooves. Other toponyms come from either the giraffe’s habits, its habitat, or its appearance. Lake Ngami in Botswana may have a name derived from Bushman *gabee* ‘giraffe,’ which has variants such as *ngami* and *n’ghabe* in other languages. These words mean “to rock.” When walking, the giraffe has a rocking motion which reminded observers of the rocking motion of waves in the lake. In Namibia, although the original name for a particular mountain range is not given, *Giraffenberge* ‘giraffe mountains’ “is in all probability a German translation of an indigenous name.” Large herds of this animal were found in the valleys of these mountains. Another toponym which may refer either to the giraffe’s size or to its habitat is *Mororothulwa*, a salt pan in the Kalahari Desert. In the Tswana language the first

component, *Mororo*, means “immense,” and *thuthlwa* is “giraffe.” Whether the meaning of the name is the saltpan of a large animal (giraffe) or a large saltpan where giraffes frequent is not clear. The size of this animal is seen in another name: in Ndebele and Zulu it is *ndlulamithi*; in Swazi, *indlulamitsi* ‘the one that reaches beyond the trees.’ Möller claims that these words are phonologically comparable to the *thuthlwa* element in *Mororothuthlwa* (181–84).

Although the lion’s share of the book is devoted to mammals, Möller does not ignore birds. One example must suffice. The largest of all the birds is the ostrich (*Struthia camelus*), *volstruis* in Afrikaans. Bushman names include, among others, *mptshu*, *tjwe*, *tue*, *twe*, and *!gom*. The strongest vocalization of this bird is a bellowing sound, or as one observer recorded, a “nocturnal, booming leonine roar,” and transcribed often as *!gom* or *!gum*. Two place names, location not given, are derived from *mptshu*: *Dimptshe* ‘many ostriches’ (*di* here indicates plural) and *Metsimptshse* ‘ostrich fountain.’ The Afrikaans name for this fountain is *Volstruisfontein*. As for the bellowing sound, the place name *Bollantlokwe*, a post office in the North West Province, “is said to refer to the sound of ostriches” and combines the Bushman *!go*, *!goe* with *kwe* from Seroa, then to *//gwe* from Sesarwa, adapted into Tswana *tlokwe*, resulting (somehow) in *Bollantlokwe* (244–46).

The few pages that Möller gives to reptiles and invertebrates include crocodiles, leguaans, agamas, lizards, snakes, frogs, toads, tortoises, and turtles among the reptiles. Invertebrates include both arachnids (scorpions and spiders) and insects (ants, bees, beetles, cockroaches, flies, crickets, grasshoppers, locusts, and wasps)

The Nile crocodile (*Crocodylus niloticus*) represents the reptiles. It is found not just in the Nile basin but throughout sub-Saharan Africa. The Hie name for crocodile is *tʃenaa*, and the Kung name is */xo/xono*, names which “appear to imitate the different sounds made by either adult crocs when blowing, roaring or hissing, and by the young hatchlings making their first croaking cries that are heard, distinctively as *tʃe*, *ngwe*-, and *ngwi*-.” In Zulu the name is similar, *ingwenya*, and toponyms based on this name are found in several places: the Ngwenya Mountain in Swaziland, the Ngwenya River, and the Ngwenya Border Post in the South African provinces of Kwa-Zulu-Natal and Mpumalanga (277–79).

With a few notable exceptions, arachnids and insects are not noted for the sounds they make. The buzzing sound of flies has led to names for this insect in Auen (*wazwa*), in Kung (*dzoã dzoã*), and in Ok!uj (*dzwã dzwã*). The only toponyms cited are in Afrikaans, *Vlieëholteberg* ‘flies hollow mountain’ and *Vlieëpoortberg* ‘mountain of the flies pass,’ but whether it is for the buzzing or for the simple presence of flies is not made clear. Möller devotes a paragraph to crickets, providing a /Xam word for this insect: *≠kwiri-ti-tiken*. Although she does not provide any toponymic examples, she suggests that this word “is perhaps the most indicative onomatopoeic example of the Bushman speakers demonstrating their close observance and emulation prowess at imitating the animal life around them” (301).

Visually, *Of the Same Breath* is a beautiful book, enhanced by 86 illustrations, including 52 by the artist Daniel Otte, internationally known naturalist and illustrator. The cover and each of the four sections of the book feature paintings by Dr. Otte, in color, of animals in their natural environments. There are also 10 sketches of human figures by Albert Viereck of rock drawings found in Namibia. Other helpful features include an extensive bibliography (123 books, 18 maps, 27 websites, and 6 sources citing emails, personal communications, and art work), a glossary of terms, an index of animal names (485 individual entries; many are cross references), an index of place names (724 total), and an index of languages (70 languages or language groups).

It is also a well-edited book, so far as I can tell. I found very few grammatical or typographical errors. But only a handful of people in the world would know if all the indigenous languages and names are correctly spelled.

I think it can be seen from this review that *Of the Same Breath* is a challenging book, both for the writer and the reader. It is easy to get lost in the many examples of words and names from such unfamiliar sources, and only a really dedicated and experienced scholar like Dr. Möller, with a life-long interest in the names of southern Africa, could have written it. I find it interesting, though, that, considering the large number of place names to be found in southern Africa, most of the examples are of relatively insignificant features. This may simply reflect colonialism, newcomers to the land choosing familiar names for major features without bothering to ask if these features already had names. There is also a good bit of uncertainty in connecting the toponyms with the words in the indigenous languages, as shown in the frequent use of phrases like “it is said” or “may derive from,” “may contain an undertone of,” “may refer to,” “in all probability,” and similar statements. Even in cases of certainty the evidence is not always convincing, as when she gives several words for the lion *zam*, *hu:m*, *ho:um*, *gamma*, *tgamma*, *chamma*, etc. and asserts that this range of names gives “a very accurate emulation of its loud roar” (72).

Möller claims that she has only broken ground in this study and hopes that other onomasticians will pick up where she feels she has not gone far enough. If I might add, the study of place names in other areas, including North America, might follow her example and look at how animal names based on their sounds, habits, and habitat may produce place names. One example is the chipmunk. The name of the eastern chipmunk (*Tamias striatus*), first recorded as *chitmunk*, comes from Ojibwa (an Algonquian language) *ajidamoo*. In Ojibwa the word *ajid* means “upside down,” and William Bright suggests that the name refers to this rodent’s habit of climbing down trees headfirst (2004, 103). But chipmunks are ground squirrels. They *can* climb trees (and come back down), but most of their lives are spent on the ground or in underground tunnels. The phonology of *ajidamoo* may also be based on the “chittering” or “chipping” sounds they make. Another name for the chipmunk is “chipping squirrel” and the name may be influenced by “chip” and “mink” (“Chipmunk Etymology”). GNIS lists 76 features in the U.S. named Chipmunk.

But we should remember that what humans hear and transcribe into words may vary widely depending on the language and the culture. After all, one person’s “bow-wow” may be another person’s “wang-wang.”

University of South Dakota, Emeritus

THOMAS J. GASQUE



Notes

1. An agreement in 1971 led to the use in linguistics of the terms *Bushman* and *Hottentot*, but both were soon seen as derogatory. *Bushman* became *San* and *Hottentot* became *Khoikhoi*. But because *San* means “people who have nothing,” *Bushman* has become acceptable again.
2. The symbols //, /, and ! represent, respectively, an alveolar lateral click (as in signaling a horse to go), a dental click (a sound we make to express disapproval, often written *tsk-tsk* or *tut-tut*), and a post-alveolar click (a sudden release of the tongue just back of the alveolar ridge). Other symbols include ≠ for a palatoalveolar click (with the tongue slightly farther back than in the post-alveolar click). Another symbol, not a click, is ʃ, for a voiceless post-alveolar fricative (sh as in shall).

Bibliography

- Bright, William. 2004. *Native American Placenames of the United States*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Chipmunk Etymology. 2020. "Chipmunk Etymology." Accessed May 2020. <https://www.etymonline.com/word/chipmunk>.
- Perrin, Noel. 1962. "Old MacBerlitz Had a Farm." *The New Yorker*, Jan. 27.